## Probabilistic Models: Spring 2014 Structure Learning with Dynamic Programming Example Solutions

We are given the following local scores for some decomposable scoring function and dataset $\mathcal{D}$.

| $\operatorname{Score}\left(A, P A_{A}: \mathcal{D}\right)$ | $P A_{A}$ | $\operatorname{Score}\left(B, P A_{B}: \mathcal{D}\right)$ | $P A_{B}$ | Score ( $\left.C, P A_{C}: \mathcal{D}\right)$ | $P A_{C}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\frac{\operatorname{score}\left(A, P A_{A}: \mathcal{D}\right)}{44.10}$ | $\xrightarrow{P} A_{A}$ | 15.11 | C E | 8.40 | B E |
| 43.55 | B E | 8.40 | C D | 25.23 | A E |
| 46.90 | E | 30.90 | D | 8.40 | B D |
| 47.93 | E | 25.37 | C | 28.04 | E |
| 45.66 | B | 31.08 | A | 30.90 | D |
| 48.17 | b | 24.11 | A C | 40.25 | B |
|  |  | 33.59 | , | 48.47 | , |


| $\operatorname{Score}\left(D, P A_{D}: \mathcal{D}\right)$ | $P A_{D}$ |
| :---: | ---: |
| 8.40 | B E |
| 8.40 | B C |
| 10.90 | E |
| 25.37 | C |
| 40.25 | B |
| 42.70 | A |
| 24.11 | A C |
| 42.94 | $\emptyset$ |


| $\operatorname{Score}\left(E, P A_{E}: \mathcal{D}\right)$ | $P A_{E}$ |
| :---: | ---: |
| 13.81 | B C |
| 12.47 | D |
| 24.07 | C |
| 43.24 | A |
| 17.95 | A C |
| 44.51 | $\emptyset$ |

1. Calculate the score of the optimal network according to these scores. Assume we want to minize the network score.

- We find the scores of the singleton subnetworks (e.g., $\mathbf{U}=\{A\}$ ) by trivially selecting the empty parent sets. For example, we see that $\operatorname{Score}(\{A\})=48.17$ and $\operatorname{Score}(\{B\})=33.59$.
- We calculate the scores of the two-variable subnetworks by adding each possible leaf to each of the singleton subnetworks according to either the algorithm or the recurrence. For example, we can calculate Score $(\{A, B\})$ using the recurrence as follows.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \operatorname{Score}(\{A, B\})=\min \{\quad\{\operatorname{Score}(\{A\})+\operatorname{BestScore}(B,\{A\})\}, \\
& \{\operatorname{Score}(\{B\})+\operatorname{BestScore}(A,\{B\})\}\}
\end{aligned}
$$

We can calculate $\operatorname{BestScore}(A,\{B\})$ by simply scanning through the list of scores and looking for the smallest value for parent sets which are subsets of $\{B\}$. In this case, BestScore $(A,\{B\})=45.66$, which happens when we select the parents of $A$ to be $\{B\}$.

We can calculate the remaining scores for two-variable subnetworks similarly. The calculations for the three-variable subnetworks continues analogously. For example, $\operatorname{Score}(\{A, B, C\})$ is calculated using the recurrence as follows.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \operatorname{Score}(\{A, B, C\})=\min \{\quad\{\operatorname{Score}(\{A, B\})+\operatorname{BestScore}(C,\{A, B\})\}, \\
& \{\operatorname{Score}(\{A, C\})+\operatorname{BestScore}(B,\{A, C\})\}, \\
& \{\operatorname{Score}(\{B, C\})+\operatorname{BestScore}(A,\{B, C\})\}\}
\end{aligned}
$$

We repeat this process layer-by-layer until we have the score for all subnetworks. The scores $\operatorname{Score}(\mathbf{U})$ is given for all subnetworks below.

| $\mathbf{U}$ | Score $(\mathbf{U})$ |
| :---: | ---: |
| $\emptyset$ | 0.00 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}\}$ | 48.18 |
| $\{\mathrm{~B}\}$ | 33.59 |
| $\{\mathrm{C}\}$ | 48.48 |
| $\{\mathrm{D}\}$ | 42.95 |
| $\{\mathrm{E}\}$ | 44.51 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{~B}\}$ | 79.26 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{C}\}$ | 96.65 |
| $\{\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{C}\}$ | 73.85 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{D}\}$ | 90.88 |
| $\{\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{D}\}$ | 73.85 |
| $\{\mathrm{C}, \mathrm{D}\}$ | 73.85 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 91.42 |
| $\{\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 78.11 |
| $\{\mathrm{C}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 72.56 |
| $\{\mathrm{D}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 55.42 |


| $\mathbf{U}$ | Score $(\mathbf{U})$ |
| :---: | ---: |
| $\{\mathrm{A}, \mathrm{B}, \mathrm{C}\}$ | 119.51 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{D}\}$ | 119.51 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{D}\}$ | 120.77 |
| $\{\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{D}\}$ | 82.26 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 121.67 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 114.61 |
| $\{\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 86.52 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{D}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 102.33 |
| $\{\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{D}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 86.33 |
| $\{\mathrm{C}, \mathrm{D}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 83.46 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{D}\}$ | 127.92 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 129.72 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{D}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 129.88 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{D}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 125.52 |
| $\{\mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{D}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 91.87 |
| $\{\mathrm{~A}, \mathrm{~B}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{D}, \mathrm{E}\}$ | 133.93 |

## Useful Algorithms

## Notation

- Score $(\mathbf{U})$. The score of the optimal subnetwork over variables $\mathbf{U}$
- BestScore $(X, \mathbf{U})$. The score of the best parent set for $X$ which is a subset of $\mathbf{U}$
- $|\mathbf{U}|$. The number of variables in $\mathbf{U}$

```
procedure Expand(node U, sorted family scores BestScore)
        for each leaf in V\\mathbf{U}\mathrm{ do}
            newScore \leftarrowScore(\mathbf{U})+BestScore(leaf,\mathbf{U})
            if newScore < Score(\mathbf{U}\cupleaf) then
                Score (\mathbf{U}\cupleaf )}\leftarrow\mathrm{ newScore
            end if
        end for
end procedure
procedure Main(variables V, sorted family scores BestScore)
        Score}(\emptyset)\leftarrow
        for layer l=0 to |V| do
            for each node \mathbf{U}\mathrm{ such that }|\mathbf{U}|=l do
                expand(\mathbf{U, BestScore)}
            end for
        end for
        return Score(V)
end procedure
```

